Minnesota Humanities Center

Change, Challenge, Confirm

About

Change, Challenge, Confirm supports students in revising their thinking as they encounter new evidence. Designed to mirror the work of historians and social scientists, the routine prompts students to consider whether new information changes, complicates, or confirms their initial ideas. By making revision an explicit and expected part of learning, the routine helps students develop evidence-based reasoning and a more nuanced understanding of complex concepts.

The routine requires minimal preparation and can be used with any source across units, topics, and grade levels. Its consistent structure builds familiarity while keeping the intellectual focus on the source itself. When used regularly, Change, Challenge, Confirm strengthens students' ability to corroborate evidence, refine claims, and reflect on how knowledge evolves over time—supporting both disciplinary thinking and student independence.

Repeatable Routine

Approximate Time: 10–15 minutes

Students revise their thinking in response to new evidence by identifying whether the information challenges, changes, or confirms their initial ideas. This routine mirrors how historians and social scientists refine interpretations as they encounter additional sources.

Best Used When:

- Introducing additional sources or new information related to a concept students have already begun to explore
- Revising initial interpretations or claims
- Practicing evidence-based reasoning and corroboration

Set Up: Provide students with a new source connected to prior analysis and a paper divided into three sections labeled Change, Challenge, and Confirm.

Teacher establishes norms:

- "When we encounter new information, we revise our thinking the way historians and social scientists do."
- “Focus on how the new information affects your previous ideas.”
- “Use evidence from the source to explain how your thinking has been changed, challenged, or confirmed.”

Activity: Students analyze the new source and respond to the prompt: *“How does this new source or information challenge, change, or confirm your thinking?”*

Students select one or more sentence stems below to explain their thinking and support their ideas with evidence from the source.

Challenge (complicate/rethink):

- *“This challenges my thinking that ___ because ___.”*

Change (revise/replace*):*

- *“I thought ___, but now I think ___ because ___.”*

Confirm (support/strengthen):

- *“This confirms my idea that ___ because ___.”*

Students then share their response with the class, in small groups, or through a gallery walk. As students share, the teacher names the disciplinary skills being practiced, such as revision of interpretation (change), complicating a claim (challenge), or corroboration (confirm).

Extension: Students return to the Wonder stage of See, Think, Wonder by generating new questions based on their revised thinking. They respond to the prompt, *“With what we know now, what do you wonder?”* Students develop new questions that focus on what they still do not know or want to investigate next. Finally, students share one new “Wonder” with the class, highlighting how their questions have evolved in response to new evidence.

Minnesota Humanities Center

Change, Challenge, Confirm Worksheet

Change	Challenge	Confirm